



GENERAL BOARD OF  
**Higher Education  
& Ministry**<sup>®</sup>

# Job Analysis Generalizability Study for the Position of United Methodist Local Pastor

## Focus Group Results

**Richard P. DeShon, Ph.D. and Abigail Quinn**

Michigan State University

December 15, 2007

General Board of Higher Education and Ministry  
The United Methodist Church  
[www.gbhem.org](http://www.gbhem.org)

## **Background**

In July 1999, Robert Kohler, the then chair of the Advisory Committee on Psychological Assessment for the United Methodist Church, contacted me with a request to evaluate the selection criteria used in the ordination process for pastors. At the time, the assessment process was largely based on clinically oriented measures of abnormal personality profiles (e.g., MMPI). The expressed desire was to develop supplementary assessments that would focus on predicting effective performance rather than abnormal behavior. The first stage of this process is an analysis of the “job” performed by pastors to determine the major tasks that make up the job of a UMC pastor and what knowledge, skill, abilities, and personal characteristics contribute to effective performance of those tasks. It was decided that, as an initial step, a small-scale job analysis should be conducted using pastors in the state of Michigan. The study concluded a bit prematurely due to funding limitations. However, a great deal was learned and the final report describing the results of this initial job analysis process was submitted to the committee on February 7, 2003.

## **Current Purpose**

In February of 2006, the committee, now led by Sharon Rubey, approached me to discuss steps that could be taken to expand the findings from the initial study. As a result of these conversations, it was decided that a second-phase study would be conducted with 3 goals. The initial study developed criteria that can be used to evaluate effective performance for pastors in Michigan. A primary goal of the second study is to evaluate the generalizability of the effectiveness findings in Michigan to a representative sample of conferences in the United Methodist Church. A second goal was to further develop the effectiveness criteria during the generalizability study. The final goal was to identify the primary Knowledge, Skills, Abilities, and Personal characteristics (KSAPs) that contribute to effective performance.

## **Literature Review**

As a first step in this process, a review of the existing literature on the work tasks, the effectiveness criteria, and the candidate competencies for the local church pastor position was

conducted. As indicated in the following sections, the review provided useful information with respect to work tasks, somewhat less information with respect to competencies, and little to no information with respect to criteria used to evaluate effective performance of the job tasks.

**Work Tasks.** A surprisingly large amount of work has been devoted to the identification of the major task clusters performed by local church pastors. This work has largely focused on the variety of roles served by pastors. Roles typically represent a collection of tasks and, as such, they are highly relevant to the focus of the current investigation. Blizzard (1955, 1965, 1958, 1985) was an early pioneer in this area and identified the six (6) clergy roles of administrator, organizer, pastor, preacher, teacher, and priest. Nelsen, Yokley and Madron (1973) identified five (5) roles described as traditional, counseling, administration, community problem solving, and Christian education. Reilly (1975) classified clergy activities into the seven (7) roles of priest, teacher, prophet, pastor, administrator, organizer, and priest-ritual. Ransom, Bryman, and Hinings (1977) identified seven (7) clergy functions as pastor, celebrant, preacher, counselor, leader, administrator, and official/representative. Towler and Coxon (1979) focused on the seven roles of administrator, celebrant, leader of local community, preacher, official, pastor, and counselor. Tiller (1983) focused on the eight (8) roles of leader, pastor, focus of the community, public spokesman, guardian of the tradition, professional minister, enabler of the laity, and church builder. Bunting (1990) initially focused on the taxonomy of priest, master, preacher, builder, manager, therapist, and practical theologian and later added enabler, evangelist, Church servant, social activist, prophet, continual learning, missionary, witness, and pioneer. Davies, Watkins, and Winter (1991) focused on clergy function rather than roles and identified the seven (7) functions as sacerdotal or priestly, pastoral work, administration, private devotions and study, diocesan and deanery duties, traveling between events, and other duties. Francis and Rodger (1994) focused on seven roles: administrator, celebrant of sacraments, community leader, leader of public worship, pastor/counselor, preacher and teacher. Nauss (1994, 1995) identified the ten (10) primary ministerial activities as evangelist, youth minister, spiritual model, community-minded minister, preacher, personal enabler, administrator, teacher, equipper, and visitor/counselor. Robbins and Francis (2000) identified the ten (10) clergy roles of

administrator, sacraments, community leader, evangelist, leader of public worship, pastor, counselor, preacher, spiritual director, teacher, and visitor.

The dimensions of pastor roles and activities presented above are largely based on questionnaires, diaries, and self-reports. Using a structured observation technique Kuhne and Donaldson (1995) characterized the pastor's work activities as highly varied, taxing, fast-paced, unrelenting and fragmented. They identified thirteen (13) major activity clusters as: Interpersonal Roles (figurehead, leader, liaison), Informational Roles (monitor, disseminator, spokesperson), Decisional Roles (entrepreneur, disturbance handler, resource allocator, negotiator), and Professional Roles (mentor, care-giver, preacher). Lehman (1993) is one of the only investigations that attempted to identify the relative frequency and importance of the various tasks performed by local church pastors. Lehman identified the eleven (11) functions of administration, visitation, personal development, counseling, sermons, teaching classes, church fellowship, community activities, social issues, funerals, and other church functions. Lehman surveyed over 500 ministers from four protestant denominations (American Baptist Churches, United Methodist Church, Presbyterian Church, United Church of Christ) on the amount of time devoted to each activity in the two weeks prior to the survey along with importance ratings for each activity. Table 1 summarizes the results of Lehman's survey results on these eleven task activities. There are clear differences in the amount of time invested into each activity. However, each of the activities is rated as important or highly important and so it is difficult to identify task clusters that are differentially important.

Table 1. Time investment and importance ratings of activities.

Role Activity	Frequency Hours Spent in Activity		Importance (1-6 scale; 6=maximal)	
	Mean	Standard Deviation	Mean	Standard Deviation
Sermons	18.0	10.5	5.60	0.69
Administration	14.4	11.8	4.18	1.16
Visitation	11.5	10.0	4.99	0.91
Personal Development	8.3	8.5	5.11	0.84
Other church structures	6.6	7.1	4.11	1.06
Counseling	5.7	6.5	4.66	1.05
Teaching Classes	5.5	5.2	4.83	0.97
Church Fellowship	5.4	4.7	4.60	0.89
Community Activities	3.8	5.6	4.13	1.06
Funerals	3.3	4.6	5.22	1.02
Social Issues	2.6	4.3	4.45	1.11

**Competencies.** Research on the clergy competencies that contribute to the successful performance of the job tasks is far less well developed than the existing knowledge of the job tasks. It appears that many, if not all, United Methodist Church conferences have developed a set of Clergy competencies or “gifts” that are used during the candidacy evaluation process. The methods used to develop these competencies are unclear and the definitions of the competencies are often ambiguous but they do serve as a useful starting point for more comprehensive investigations. Additional published work was evaluated to form a set of potential competencies for use during the focus group interview process described below.

Research by the Garrett Evangelical Theological Seminary focused on the establishment of competencies used to determine whether a student was ready to fully utilize the Clinical Pastoral Education process (Means, 1980). They outlined three criteria, including (1) the ability to integrate cognitive and experiential learning, (2) the ability to form empathic relationships, and

(3) the ability to accept and carry out the role of student chaplain. However, only the first two of these competencies were appropriately conceptualized, operationalized, and measured (Hinkle & Haight, 1990). Comer (1990) evaluated the ministerial assessment battery that was currently being used. Four tests were used (measuring interests, personality, and intelligence) as well as recommendation letters. He found that these methods accounted for only 30% of the variance in ordination decisions and that ordination decisions in general were unpredictable. Since much of the data involved subjective judgments that were subject to error and bias, Comer suggested that utilizing objective measures would be beneficial.

Majovski and Malony (1990) described the Effectiveness Study that they conducted in 1985 with the purpose of investigating the relationship between psychological assessment recommendations and measures of ministerial effectiveness. They described eight primary effectiveness criteria and five secondary effectiveness criteria. While the primary criteria were related to ministerial behaviors, the secondary criteria were related to the financial and numerical consequences of leadership including church budget and attendance. They found that psychological recommendations for ordination were based on personality and interest data, but they found no relationship between the MMPI and the measures of effectiveness. Additionally, they found that pastors' self-ratings of effectiveness did not relate to the measures of effectiveness, which may indicate that pastors may have definitions of effectiveness that are discrepant from those of their supervisors or members.

Finally, the O\*NET dictionary of occupational titles (Farr and Ludden, 2001) provides a generic clergy job description. It contains some useful information but attempts to describe the jobs in terms of common attributes across jobs. As such it misses critical components of this unique job and portrays many components in terms of general managerial functions and does not adequately capture the spiritual aspects of the position.

## **Methodology**

To achieve the goals specified above, focus group methods (e.g., Morgan, 1993; Stewart, Shamdasani, and Rook, 2007; Vaugh, Schumm, and Sinagub 1996) were used to conduct interviews in four geographically and demographically diverse conferences: Florida, New York, Texas, and Southwest Texas. Attempts were made to include the California-Pacific conference but conference representatives were unable to respond to our participation requests within the necessary timeframe. To identify the focus group participants both the Boards of Ordained Ministry and the District Superintendents were asked to nominate pastors in their conference or district whom they considered to be most effective. Since one of the purposes of the study is to determine the meaning of effective performance, we did not provide a definition of effectiveness to use when conference representatives identified high performing pastors. We simply asked the representatives to name individuals whom they considered to have been successful given the context in which they had been serving. To maximize the diversity among the focus group participants, we asked the conference representatives to consider a range of demographic characteristics including gender, racial and ethnic backgrounds, as well as persons from various ministry settings (urban, suburban, rural, large, medium, and small churches, etc.). Our primary goal was for the pastors that were identified to be effective, and our secondary goal was for the pastors to be representative of the wide array of pastors in The United Methodist Church.

Based on the nominations received from the Boards of Ordained Ministry and the District Superintendents, we formed groups of 4-6 potential participants for each district. These groups were formed in such a way that the pastors were as diverse as possible, but also worked within several hours of one another to make meeting as a group possible. The pastors in each focus group received e-mail informing them that they had been nominated as effective and asking them to participate in a focus group interview. The dates and meeting places were scheduled by Sharon Rubey. Each focus group met at a church or United Methodist Conference center that was in a central location within the conference. Each focus group interview lasted two to four hours and was conducted by Rick DeShon and Abby Quinn.

## **Participants**

Twenty local church pastors participated in four focus group interviews ranging in size from four to six individuals. Based on reported data, nine participants were female (45%), fourteen were Caucasian (70%), four were Black (20%), and two were Hispanic (10%). The average age of participants was 49.6 years with a standard deviation of 8.06 and ranged from a low of 34 to a high of 63 years. Fourteen participants had full elder (i.e., elder in full connection) status (70%), four participants were full time local pastors (20%), and two participants held probationary elder status (10%). The average length of time in current status (full elder, probationary elder, and full time local pastor) was 12 years with a standard deviation of 9.03 and ranged from a low of 1 year to a high of 27 years. The average Sunday worship attendance in the respective churches was 909.25 with a standard deviation of 1813.61 and ranged from 60 to 7,529 individuals. Eight (40%) of the churches were in urban areas, two (10%) were in cities with populations greater than 100,000, and ten (50%) were in rural areas.

## **Results**

### **Pastors' Definitions of Effectiveness**

The participants in the current focus groups demonstrated strong convergence in the definition of effectiveness with participants in the prior evaluation (DeShon & Vanden Bosch, 2003).

Perceptions of effectiveness are based on the influence of the pastor in the lives of his/her church members. This influence has several components including:

**Calling.** Effective pastors possess a profound inner sense of being “called by” and “called to”: called by God and called to ministry that involves a deep trust in God. This calling and trust become evident in a willingness to act boldly – and take risks – as part of that called ministry.

**Leadership.** Effective pastors have the ability to cast a vision and mobilize and empower people to work toward it. Effective pastors influence people in ways that will help them achieve their goals.

**Transforming lives.** Effective pastors are able to transform lives. People with transformed lives experience spirituality as part of their identity; that is, they incorporate spirituality into their everyday lives. People with transformed lives experience God in their lives every day of the week – not just on Sundays. Transforming lives involves seeing people grow in their love of God and develop a deeper relationship with God. People with transformed lives also have a genuine desire for spiritual growth.

**Helping others.** Effective pastors help people discover and utilize their gifts for the good of their communities. They help people grow personally as well as spiritually. They help people become better, more spiritual people who make better decisions and have stronger, healthier relationships with God and others.

### **Task Clusters that Contribute to Effective Performance**

To identify a set of competencies that described an effective pastor, we first need to understand the nature of the job and the tasks performed by local church pastors. We asked participants to describe the many tasks they perform that contribute to effective performance. From the resulting discussions, a consistent set of task dimensions emerged. There is substantial overlap with the task clusters identified in the previous study but we have refined the conceptualization and many of the task cluster labels based on the current results. The thirteen (13) task clusters that emerged from the focus group interviews are presented in Table 2 and then followed by a brief definition of each task cluster and examples of behaviors that exemplify the task clusters. The examples are drawn from the content focus group interviews and are used to highlight the breadth and depth of each task cluster. At the present time, the relative importance of these task clusters is not known and the order of presentation is alphabetical. Finally, it is important to highlight that this analysis focuses on externally observable activities, actions, or behaviors. As such they may miss many fundamental concepts underlying worship, communion, and grace and may not adequately capture the underlying purpose of the behavior. In other words, a task or job analysis seeks to reflect the observable behaviors and tasks performed in the job of a local pastor

and is likely incapable of adequately capturing important but unobservable states such as being in a state of worship, prayer, or grace.

Table 2. Effective Performance Task Clusters

<b>Administration</b>	<b>Relationship Building</b>	<b>Preaching and Public Worship</b>
<b>Care-giving</b>	<b>Evangelism</b>	<b>Self-Development</b>
<b>Rituals &amp; Sacraments</b>	<b>Fellowship</b>	<b>UM Connectional Service</b>
<b>Facility Construction</b>	<b>Management</b>	
<b>Communication</b>	<b>Other-Development</b>	

Administration – Performing activities that support the efficient functioning of the organization

- Accounting
- Bookkeeping
- Budgeting
- Financial Forecasting
- Facilities Maintenance
- Formal interactions with external organizations (e.g., United Methodist Church, Local, State, and National Government)
- Purchasing and Maintaining Equipment
- Ordering supplies
- Recording, storing, or maintaining information in written or electronic form
- Risk Management (e.g., insurance and investments)

Care-giving – Performing activities that serve the spiritual, mental, or physical needs of congregants or community members

- Relationship counseling

- Grief counseling
- Addiction counseling
- Crisis intervention
- Hospital or home visitation
- Arranging care systems for individuals with physical limitations or poor health
- Provide assistance during emergencies or crises
- Assists victims of neglect or injustice
- Ministers to the sick, dying, and bereaved

Communication – Performing activities that transmit information to others in a comprehensible form

- Interpreting events for congregants
- Disseminating information to relevant parties
- Share information about religious issues by writing articles, giving speeches, or teaching
- Provide information to superintendents, supervisors, other local pastors, church staff, congregants, local government, and community members by telephone, in written form, e-mail, or in person
- Obtain information from relevant sources to support decisions
- Relates God's activity to everyday life and happenings

Relationship Building – Performing activities that create, maintain, and strengthen personal and professional relationships with congregants, community members, United Methodist Church members, and members of other denominations

- Individual or small group meetings with congregants
- Hosting dinners
- Leading prayer at community events
- Participating in community events
- Organize and engage in interfaith, community, civic, educational, and recreational activities

- Develop constructive and cooperative working relationships with others
- Speaks to community and civic groups
- Participates in social activities to develop and strengthen relationships
- Participates in community projects and organizations
- Interact with the community through social actions
- Learn the history and culture of the local church
- Work with clergy and laity of other faiths, religions, denominations, or sects

Evangelism – Performing activities that bring individuals into a personal relationship with Christ

- Develop and implement methods for increasing congregation size
- Fundraising to support local, national, or international missions
- Developing websites to reach more people with an evangelical message
- Incorporating video, contemporary music, and interactivity into worship experiences to better connect with younger individuals
- Develop methods for increasing congregation membership
- Leads people in the process of reaching out to the unchurched in the community
- Urges people to share their faith with others

Facility Construction – Performing activities to renovate existing or build new church structures

- Leading or participating in architectural design processes
- Meeting with local government representatives to obtain necessary permits
- Raise funds to support congregation activities and facilities
- Scheduling planning and progress review meetings
- Construction

Fellowship - Leading or participating in activities that support the sharing of common interests, desires, and motivations among Christians

- Fosters fellowship at church gatherings
- Coffee Hours
- Fellowship Dinners
- Prayer Chains
- Men's Breakfasts
- Youth Groups
- Church Picnics
- Sacred Music Concerts

Management – Performing activities that mobilize and coordinate staff and congregants to achieve organizational goals

- Negotiation
- Conflict Management
- Scheduling events, programs, and activities for self and others
- Staffing by matching tasks and jobs with congregant strengths
- Identify and develop lay leaders
- Motivating a voluntary workforce
- Cheerleading subordinate activities
- Planning methods to accomplish organizational goals
- Organizing and coordinating efforts to achieve organizational goals
- Getting members of a group to work together to accomplish tasks
- Quality control
- Resource allocation
- Leading or participating in project teams to accomplish specific goals and church functions
- Developing and communicating long-term church goals (i.e., visioning)
- Developing and building teams
- Organizing, planning, and prioritizing work

- Analyze information to choose the best solution
- Problem solves and idea development for new activities, projects, and programs
- Works with congregational boards and committees

Other-Development – Performing activities to teach, train, or mentor individuals and groups to improve their knowledge and skills

- Teach Bible Study classes
- Teach discipleship
- Train senior staff
- Teach a world religions course at a local prison
- Teach spiritual disciplines (i.e., Prayer, Bible study, Worship, Fasting, Conversation with other Christians)
- Develop church leadership through disciple-building and staff training
- Plan and lead religious education programs for congregants
- Instruct individuals who seek to become members of the United Methodist Church
- Mentor aspiring and less experienced lay and ordained pastors in both formal and informal capacities
- Mentor a youth director in the candidacy process
- Mentor Associate pastors
- Trains lay leaders
- Helps youth identify goals and gifts
- Talks with individuals about their spiritual development
- Counsels with people facing major life decisions (e.g., marriage and career)
- “Give the job away” by empowering, equipping, and encouraging others (congregants, fellow pastors, and community members) to serve God
- Serving as a spiritual model

Preaching and Public Worship – Performing activities to support and lead public worship services and convey spiritual and moral messages through public speaking

- Prepare and deliver sermons
- Prepare and deliver public speeches
- Read and listen to examples of good sermons
- Plan and conduct public worship services
- Communicate religious lessons
- Incorporate current events into the communicated message
- Develop alternative worship approaches (technologies)
- Lead prayer

Rituals and Sacraments – Leading or participating in ceremonies such as baptism, communion, funerals, and weddings

- Administer religious rites or ordinances
- Prepare people for participation in religious ceremonies

Self-Development – Activities designed to improve spiritual, mental, and physical development that contribute to the delivery of more effective ministry.

- Studying religious books and documents
- Studying administration and management books and documents
- Practicing spiritual disciplines
- Physical fitness
- Maintaining balance between time for self, family, and congregants
- Maintains a disciplined life of prayer and personal devotion
- Cultivates home and personal life
- Participating in support groups such as covenant groups and prayer circles
- Skill updating
- Keeping up-to-date with technological advances (e.g., computers, Internet, PDAs)
- Setting and maintaining personal boundaries

- Developing personal support systems (e.g., covenant groups and prayer teams)
- Participation in conference and continuing education programs

United Methodist Connectional Service – Performing activities that contribute to the goals of the United Methodist Church that extend beyond the scope of the local church

- Travel
- Writing reports
- Participating in planning and governance committees within the United Methodist Church organization (e.g., annual conference planning and Boards of Ordained Ministry)
- Attending Annual Conference meetings
- Committee work
- Participation in expert panels and focus groups
- Apportionments and Stewardship

Finally, the results of our focus group interview strongly support the findings of Kuhne and Donaldson (1995) in that the pastor's work activities are highly varied, taxing, fast-paced, unrelenting and often fragmented. This requires that the pastor be able to rapidly switch between highly diverse roles such as mentor, preacher, counselor, spiritual leader, and prophet. The participants in the focus group interviews also demonstrated and discussed the importance of multitasking or polychronic behavior (e.g., listening to sermon examples from other pastors during the morning fitness run). Although, the current data do not allow a ranking of these task clusters in terms of frequency or importance, the existing work by Lehman (1993) and Kuhne and Donaldson (1995) provide useful information. Kuhne and Donaldson (1995) highlight that the majority of desk work is devoted to preparations for preaching whereas nearly  $\frac{3}{4}$  of the time spent in scheduled meetings was devoted to counseling, evangelism, fellowship, preaching, teaching, and worship. Lehman's results (presented above in Table 1) suggest that substantial time is spent preaching or preparing for preaching, visitation, administration, and personal development. Further work, as discussed below, is necessary to better delineate the frequency and importance of the major task clusters identified in this research.

### **Knowledge, Skills, Abilities, and Personal Characteristics**

After discussing the definitions of effectiveness and the major task clusters, each group engaged in a discussion of the knowledge, skills, abilities, and personal characteristics that contributed to effective performance of the many identified tasks. The following definitions and examples were provided to participants to frame the conceptualization of KSAPs during this section of the focus group interviews.

**Knowledge** – An organized set of principles and facts applying in general domains

*Administration and Management* – knowledge of business and management principles involved in strategic planning, resource allocation, human resources modeling, leadership technique, production methods, and coordination of people and resources

**Skills** – developed capacities that facilitate learning or the more rapid acquisition of knowledge

*Social perceptiveness* – being aware of others' reactions and understanding why they react as they do

**Abilities** – enduring attributes of the individual that influence performance

*Oral expression* – the ability to communicate information and ideas in speaking so others will understand

**Personal characteristics** – personality variables, interests, and experiences

*Openness* – Openness to experience involves active imagination, aesthetic sensitivity, attentiveness to inner feelings, preference for variety, and intellectual curiosity

Table 3, on the following page, presents the list of identified KSAPs. The labels used to describe the KSAPs reflect a combination of the raw information obtained in the focus group interviews, terms used in the existing literature, and our judgment based on psychological and job analysis principles. Many of the terms are self-evident while others represent terms of art in the job analysis literature. Precise definitions of each KSAP are presented in the Appendix. These individual differences serve as the target for selection, ordination decisions, and training and developmental procedures. In the focus group interviews, the call to ministry permeated all KSAP discussions. Given the ubiquity and importance of this concept, it was decided to include it as a component under each of the Knowledge, Skills, Abilities, and Personal Characteristics categories.

Table 3. List of Knowledge, Skills, Abilities, and Personal Characteristics that contribute to effective performance.

<i>Knowledge</i>	<i>Skills</i>	<i>Abilities</i>	<i>Personal Characteristics</i>
Administration	Active Learning	Adaptability	Achievement orientation
Calling to Ministry	Active Listening	Attentional Focus	Attention to Detail
Clerical	Calling to Ministry	Calling to Ministry	Authenticity
Community Demographics	Conflict management	Creativity	Autonomy
Community History	Decision Making	Idea Fluency	Balance
Counseling Principles	Discernment	Inductive Reasoning	Calling to Ministry
Local Church History	Exegetical Skills	Intelligence	Cooperation
Management Principles	Goal-setting and Feedback	Memorization	Dependability
Psychology	Motivating Others	Oral Comprehension	Empathy
Sociology	Multitasking	Reading Comprehension	Initiative
Theology and Scripture	Negotiation	Trust in God	Integrity
Training Principles	Oral Communication		Leadership
United Methodist Church Doctrine	Problem Solving		Learning Orientation
	Public Speaking		Openness
	Social Perceptiveness		Passion
	Spiritual Disciplines		Patience
	Teaching		Persistence
	Teamwork		Risk-Taking
	Time Management		Self-Awareness
	Written Communication		Self-Control
			Social Orientation
			Stress Tolerance
			Willingness to seek help

### **Recommendations and Next Steps**

The major task clusters presented in this report represent a comprehensive picture of the local church pastor position and the identified KSAPs provide a comprehensive picture of the types of person who would likely provide excellent performance in the position. However, the position of local church pastor does not appear to be homogeneous. Based on the interview responses, it appears that factors such as church size, rural vs. urban, and church age substantially affect frequency and importance of the various tasks in a particular church. Similarly, it is almost inconceivable to imagine that a single person could be uniformly high on the sixty-four (64) distinct knowledge, skills, abilities, and personal characteristics specified in Table 3. The existing literature on forming a taxonomy of pastor competencies has largely focused on personality characteristics and, as such, misses a large portion of the KSAPs identified in this research. Given the existence of church and person heterogeneity, a standard selection model would not likely result in the highest performance within and across churches. Instead, it appears that a system that focuses on matching pastor KSAPs with church types and then focuses on providing training to improve knowledge and skills needed for a particular church type would be most effective. The focus group methodology employed in this research is designed to provide a snapshot of the position and the qualities of high performing people in the position. It is not well suited to capturing the heterogeneity of the jobs or people.

Given the description above, there are two logical next steps to improve the effectiveness of local church pastors. First, it is important to understand the relative frequency and importance of tasks performed in different church types. A widely distributed survey assessing the frequency and importance of tasks across a wide variety of churches would provide the information necessary to form a taxonomy of church types. A second benefit of this survey would be to further evaluate the generalizability of results found in the six conferences examined to date. The survey would provide one important piece of the puzzle concerning the heterogeneity of churches.

Once the church types are well understood, the next step would be to assess the KSAPs identified here for a large sample of pastors identified as being particularly effective in specific

church types. This would make it possible to develop a profile of an effective minister given the type of church and would allow more informed matching of pastors to churches. It would also provide a mechanism for developing career paths for ministers and training programs to strengthen identified weaknesses.

Finally, the breadth of tasks performed by local church pastors coupled with the rapid switching between task clusters and roles that appears prevalent in this position is unique. I have never encountered such a face-paced job with such varied and impactful responsibilities. It would be extremely informative to perform a study using structured observation methods to extend the findings of Kuhne and Donaldson (1995). Are multitasking skill and polychronic orientation critical to effective performance in this position or is it possible for individuals with lower levels of these skills and orientations to structure work in such a way to perform effectively despite the demands of the job?

## Appendix

**Knowledge**

*Administration* – Knowledge of the principles involved in the organization and coordination of people and resources.

*Calling to Ministry* – The ability to experience, identify, and understand the inner urge to pursue the pastorate as a vocation.

*Church History* – Knowledge of the history and development of the local church.

*Clerical* – Knowledge of administrative and clerical procedures and systems such as word processing, managing files and records, stenography and transcription, designing forms, and other office procedures and terminology.

*Community Demographics* – Knowledge of the demographics of the community in which the local church exists and of the issues important to the people of those demographics.

*Community History* – Knowledge of the history and culture of the community in which the local church exists.

*Counseling Principles* – Knowledge of principles, methods, and procedures for diagnosis, treatment, and rehabilitation of physical and mental dysfunctions, and for career counseling and guidance.

*Management Principles* – Knowledge of the principles involved in motivating, developing, and directing people as they work.

*Psychology* – Knowledge of human behavior and performance; individual differences in ability, personality, and interests; learning and motivation; and the assessment and treatment of behavioral and affective disorders.

*Sociology* – Knowledge of group behavior and dynamics, societal trends and influences, human migrations, ethnicity, and cultures.

*Theology and Scripture* – Knowledge of philosophy about the existence and nature of God, religion, and biblical text.

*Training Principles* – Knowledge of principles and methods for curriculum and training design, teaching and instruction for individuals and groups, and the measurement of training effects.

*United Methodist Church Doctrine* – Knowledge of the written body of teachings of The United Methodist Church.

## **Skills**

*Active Learning* – Seeking and rapidly integrating new information to improve current and future problem-solving and decision-making.

*Active Listening* – Giving full attention to what other people are saying, taking time to understand the points being made, asking questions as appropriate, and not interrupting at inappropriate times.

*Calling to Ministry* – The ability to experience, identify, and understand the inner urge to pursue the pastorate as a vocation.

*Conflict Management* – Handling complaints, settling disputes, and resolving conflicts.

*Decision Making* – Considering the relative costs and benefits of potential actions to choose the most appropriate one.

*Discernment* – The capacity to know God's will through the haze of one's motives, the motives of others, and events that may appear to be important but are actually trivial or irrelevant.

*Exegetical Skill* – Communicating the meaning of Scripture and other religious documents in a manner that is comprehensible to others.

*Goal-setting and Feedback* – Establishing long-range objectives, specifying the strategies and actions to achieve them, and providing feedback about progress toward them.

*Motivating Others* – relating to others in a way that inspires them to want to do their best to complete a desired course of action.

*Multitasking* – Performing two or more tasks simultaneously or rapidly switching attention between tasks.

*Negotiation* – Working with others to arrive at a mutually agreeable resolution to a problem.

*Oral Communication* – Composing and delivering information through verbal interactions in a manner that others understand.

*Problem Solving* – Identifying problems and integrating information to formulate solutions.

*Public Speaking* – Effective communication of a message to a group of individuals using the spoken word.

*Social Perceptiveness* – Being aware of others' reactions and understanding why they react as they do.

*Spiritual Disciplines* – Use of the spiritual disciplines to facilitate spiritual growth.

*Teaching* – Identifying the educational needs of others and providing effective instruction to improve their knowledge or skills.

*Teamwork* - Accomplishing tasks directly by working as a member of a team or indirectly by helping members of a team to cooperate and efficiently coordinate actions and decisions.

*Time Management* – Managing one's own time and the time of others to efficiently accomplish goals.

*Written Communication* – Communicating effectively in writing as appropriate for the needs of the reader.

**Abilities**

*Adaptability* – The capability to adjust actions in relation to new situations, others’ actions, or changes in the environment.

*Attentional Focus* – The ability to concentrate on a task over a period of time without being distracted.

*Calling to Ministry* – The ability to experience, identify, and understand the inner urge to pursue the pastorate as a vocation.

*Creativity* – The ability to generate unusual or clever ideas about a given topic, situation, or problem.

*Idea Fluency* – The ability to rapidly develop a large number of ideas related to a given topic.

*Inductive Reasoning* – The ability to combine pieces of information to detect patterns or form general rules.

*Intelligence* – The ability to reason, plan, solve problems, think abstractly, comprehend ideas and language, and learn.

*Memorization* – The ability to store and recall information and experiences.

*Oral Comprehension* – The ability to listen to and understand information and ideas presented through spoken words and sentences.

*Reading Comprehension* – The ability to read and understand information and ideas presented through written words, sentences and paragraphs in documents.

*Trust in God* – The ability to place oneself in the care of God.

**Personal characteristics**

*Achievement Orientation* – Tendency to establish and maintain personally challenging goals and exert effort toward achieving them.

*Attention to Detail* – Tendency to be careful about detail and thorough in completing work tasks.

*Authenticity* – Tendency to consistently behave in a fashion that is consistent with one's values, principles, and beliefs, to experience a sense of meaning or purpose underlying behavior, and to show vulnerability when appropriate.

*Autonomy* – Tendency to develop one's own ways of doing things, guiding oneself with little or no supervision, and depending on oneself to get things done.

*Balance* – Tendency to maintain a balance of important life activities related to profession, self, family, and friends.

*Calling to Ministry* – The ability to experience, identify, and understand the inner urge to pursue the pastorate as a vocation.

*Cooperation* – Tendency to be pleasant with others and display a good-natured, cooperative attitude.

*Dependability* – Tendency to be reliable, responsible, dependable, and fulfilling obligations.

*Empathy* – Tendency to be aware of, understanding of, and sensitive to other people's experiences and emotions.

*Initiative* – Tendency to take on responsibilities and challenges to accomplish goals.

*Integrity* – Tendency to adherence to a strict moral or ethical code with a special emphasis on being honest to oneself and others.

*Learning Orientation* – Tendency to develop one's competence through expanding one's ability and mastering challenging situations.

*Leadership* – Willingness to lead, take charge, and provide opinions and direction when necessary to accomplish goals.

*Openness* – Tendency to be receptive to ideas and people that are different from oneself.

*Passion* – Tendency to experience and express enthusiasm in daily activities and interactions with others.

*Patience* – Tendency to cope with pain, troubles, difficulties, or hardship, without complaint or ill temper.

*Persistence* – Tendency to continue investing efforts to obtain goals in the face of obstacles.

*Risk-Taking* – Tendency to undertake important tasks despite a lack of certainty or a fear of failure.

*Self-awareness* – Knowledge and understanding of ones motivations, strengths, and weaknesses.

*Self Control* – Tendency Maintaining composure, keeping emotions in check, controlling anger, and avoiding aggressive behavior in difficult situations.

*Social Orientation* – Tendency to prefer working with others rather than alone and to be personally connected with others.

*Stress Tolerance* – Tendency to accept criticism well and deal calmly and effectively with high stress situations.

*Willingness to seek help* – Tendency to ask for help with overwhelming tasks or to seek help from others to compensate for one's own weaknesses.

## References

- Aleshire, D. O. (1980). Eleven major areas of ministry. In Schuller, D. S., Strommen, M. P., & Brekke, M. L., *Ministry in America* (pp. xxx-xxx). City: Publisher.
- Aleshire, D. O. (1990). ATS profiles of ministry project. In Hunt, R. A., Hinkle, J. E., & Malony, H. N., *Clergy Assessment and Career Development* (pp. 97-103). Nashville: Abingdon Press.
- Blizzard, S. W. (1955). The roles of the rural parish minister, the protestant seminaries and the science of social behaviour. *Religious Education*, 50, 383-392.
- Blizzard, S. W. (1956). The minister's dilemma. *The Christian Century*, 73, 505-509.
- Blizzard, S. W. (1958). The parish minister's self-image of his master role. *Pastoral Psychology*, 89, 23-32.
- Blizzard, S. W. (1958). The protestant parish minister's integrating roles. *Religious Education*, 53, 374-80.
- Blizzard, S. W. (1985). *The protestant parish minister: A behavioral science interpretation*. Society for the Scientific Study of Religion Monograph Series, no. 5. Storrs, CT: Society for the Scientific Study of Religion.
- Bunting, I. D. (1990). *The places to train: A survey of theological training in Britain*. Eltham, MARC Europe.
- Coates, C. H. & Kistler, R. C. (1965). Role Dilemmas of Protestant Clergymen in a Metropolitan Community. *Review of Religious Research*, 6, 147-52.

- Comer, M. P. (1990). Psychometric characteristics of a ministerial assessment battery. In Hunt, R. A., Hinkle, J. E., & Malony, H. N., *Clergy Assessment and Career Development* (pp. 72-77). Nashville: Abingdon Press.
- Davies, D., Watkins, C., & Winter, M. (1991). *Church and Religion in Rural England*. Edinburgh: T and T Clark.
- DeShon, R. P. & Vanden Bosch, K. L. (2003). Job Analysis for the Position of United Methodist Minister: Focus Group Results. Technical report submitted to the Advisory Committee on Psychological Assessment for the United Methodist Church.
- Francis, L. J. & Rodger, R. (1994). The personality profile of Anglican clergymen. *Contact*, 113, 27-32.
- Francis, L. J. & Rodger, R. (1996). The influence of personality on clergy role prioritisation, role influences, conflict and dissatisfaction with ministry. In L. J. Francis & S. H. Jones (Eds.), *Psychological Perspectives on Christian Ministry* (pp. 65-81). Leominster: Gracewing.
- Farr, J. M. & Ludden, L. L. (2001). The Onet dictionary of occupational titles (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Indianapolis, IN: JIST Works, Inc.
- Foss, R., & Hunt, R. A. (2000). Qualifications for Christian leadership: A review of empirical research and other literature. Advisory Committee on Psychological Research.
- Hinkle, J. E., & Haight, E. C. (1990). Issues and models in criterion development. In Hunt, R. A., Hinkle, J. E., & Malony, H. N., *Clergy Assessment and Career Development* (pp. 61-66). Nashville: Abingdon Press.

- Kuhne, G. W., & Donaldson, J. F. (1995). Balancing ministry and management: An exploratory study of pastoral work activities. *Review of Religious Research, 37*, 147-163.
- Lehman, E. C. (1993). *Gender and Work: The case of the Clergy*. Albany: State University of New York Press.
- Majovski, L. F., & Malony, H. N. (1990). Predicting ministerial effectiveness. In Hunt, R. A., Hinkle, J. E., & Malony, H. N., *Clergy Assessment and Career Development* (pp. 86-89). Nashville: Abingdon Press.
- Means, J. J. (1980). An investigation of an assessment model for the evaluation of the capacity of seminary students to utilize clinical pastoral education as a professional learning experience. Unpublished dissertation, Northwestern University.
- Morgan, D. L. (Ed.). (1993). *Successful focus groups: Advancing the state of the art*. Newbury Park, California: Sage Publications.
- Nauss, A. (1994) Ministerial effectiveness in ten functions. *Review of religious research, 36*, 58-69.
- Nauss, A. (1995). The pastor as leader, shepherd, rancher, or...? *Journal of Psychology and Theology, 2*, 115-128.
- Nelsen, H. M., Yokley, R. R. & Madron, T. W. (1973). Ministerial roles and social actionist stance: Protestant clergy and protest in the sixties. *American Sociological Review, 38*, 375-86.
- Ranson, S., Bryman, A. & Hinings, B. (1977). *Clergy, Ministers and Priests*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.
- Reilly, M. E. (1975). Perceptions of the Priest Role. *Sociological Analysis, 35*, 347-356.

Robbins, M., & Francis, L. J. (2000). Role prioritisation among clergywomen: The influence of personality and church tradition among female stipendiary Anglican clerics in the UK. *British Journal of Theological Education*, 11, 7–23.

Stewart, D.W., Shamdasani, P.N., & Rook, D.W. (2007). *Focus Groups: Theory and Practice* (2nd Edition). Thousand Oaks, California: Sage Publications.

Tiller, J. (1983). *A Strategy for the Church's Ministry*. London: Church Information Office.

Towler, R. & Coxon, A. (1979). *The fate of the Anglican clergy: A sociological study*. London: The MacMillan Press Ltd.

Vaugh, S., Schumm, J.S., & Sinagub, J. (1996). *Focus Group Interviews in Education and Psychology*. Thousand Oaks, California: Sage Publications.